Smart Cities and Tourism: A Paradiplomatic Approach Between Jakarta and Galicia

Rafi Ferdilianto*, Bariq Akmal Malik, Christopher David Evans, Fira Najwah BSA, Nadira Refiana

International Relations Department, Universitas Pembangunan Nasional "Veteran" Jakarta, Indonesia
*Corresponding author, e-mail: rafi19ferdi@gmail.com

Article Info
Article history:
Received 13 Nov 2023
Revised 01 Dec 2023
Accepted 30 Dec 2023

ABSTRACT
This study investigates the role of paradiplomacy in fostering enhanced cooperation between Jakarta, Indonesia, and Galicia, Spain, focusing on smart city initiatives and tourism development. Sub-state actors such as city, NGO and MNC nowadays have the rights to participate in the national agenda. In this area, Jakarta and Galicia both are a good example, in which those cities have multiple similarities in achieving their national agenda. Jakarta is known as a capital city of Indonesia, who become the main area of national economy improvement. Also in the other hand, Jakarta applied a concept of smart city in order to maximize the potential of its own area. Jakarta has successfully applied the concept correctly, which it answered by the infrastructure sector Jakarta made MRT and LRT which one of the goals of the concept. Galicia is known as city who has huge potential in its tourism sector and, also the management of the sector is rather quite neat. this paper explores the potential for bilateral paradiplomatic engagement to promote economic and infrastructural development. The findings suggest that paradiplomacy not only serves as a vital instrument for urban development but also paves the way for sustainable and mutually beneficial international collaborations.

Keywords: Paradiplomacy, Smart City, Tourism Development, International Cooperation, Jakarta-Galicia Relations

ABSTRAK

Kata Kunci: Paradiplomasi, Kota Cerdas, Pengembangan Pariwisata, Kerjasama Internasional, Hubungan Jakarta-Galicia
1. Introduction

In an era where the dynamics of international relations are increasingly influenced by globalization and technological advancements, the concept of diplomacy has undergone a significant transformation. The traditional paradigm, once monopolized by national governments, has evolved to embrace a more inclusive and decentralized approach, known as paradiplomacy. This shift enables sub-state entities, such as cities and regions, to engage directly in the international arena, fostering collaborations that transcend national boundaries (Fathun, 2016). This evolving landscape offers a unique vantage point to examine how cities like Jakarta, Indonesia, and Galicia, Spain, are leveraging paradiplomacy to pursue their developmental objectives.

Jakarta, as the bustling capital of Indonesia, epitomizes the nation's economic ambition and cultural vibrancy. It serves as a testament to how local governance can significantly impact national development through strategic urban planning and infrastructure enhancement. The city's pursuit of the "Smart City" vision, characterized by its commitment to smart governance, economy, mobility, environment, living, and service, illustrates an integrated approach to addressing urban challenges while promoting sustainable growth (Mauleny, 2015). This ambitious initiative is not merely about adopting advanced technologies but also about fostering an inclusive and responsive urban ecosystem that caters to the diverse needs of its inhabitants.

The development trajectory of Jakarta is marked by significant infrastructural projects, including the expansion of mass rapid transit systems and the adoption of environmentally friendly transportation solutions. These initiatives reflect Jakarta's commitment to enhancing accessibility and reducing its carbon footprint, showcasing the city's role as a pioneer in sustainable urban development in Southeast Asia (Astutik and Gunartin, 2019). The comprehensive development strategy employed by Jakarta, from bolstering its digital infrastructure to enhancing public services, sets a precedent for how cities can influence national economic trends and contribute to global discussions on urban sustainability.

Conversely, Galicia, located at the northwestern edge of Spain, presents a distinct yet equally compelling narrative of regional development. Despite its peripheral geographical location, Galicia has emerged as a significant economic player within Spain, thanks to its robust industrial sector and strategic investments. With a diverse economy ranging from metalworking to luxury gemstone production, Galicia demonstrates the potential of regional economies to contribute to national prosperity. The region's commitment to innovation and quality has not only bolstered its economic profile but also positioned it as a leader in Spain's industrial landscape (Galicia, 2014).

Moreover, Galicia's rich cultural heritage and natural beauty, coupled with its advancements in infrastructure and technology, render it an attractive destination for tourists and investors alike. The existence of Free Trade Zones and the region's focus on sustainable business practices exemplify Galicia's proactive approach to economic development and international trade. Galicia's strategic initiatives, from enhancing its technological capabilities to investing in transportation infrastructure, reflect a comprehensive approach to regional development that aligns with global sustainability goals.
2. Theoretical Framework

2.1. The Dynamics of Paradiplomacy: Subnational Actors on the Global Stage

In an increasingly interconnected world, the traditional boundaries of international relations are being redefined. The concept of paradiplomacy has emerged as a pivotal mechanism through which subnational actors, such as cities and regions, engage in direct diplomatic activities with foreign partners. This evolution signifies a departure from the conventional model where the state was the sole actor in international relations. Instead, local governments and other subnational entities are now recognized as dynamic participants, capable of pursuing specific regional interests and objectives on the global stage. This shift is largely attributed to the recognition that these actors possess a deep understanding of their local context and potentials, often more so than central governments (Michelmann, 2009; Lecours, 2008).

Paradiplomacy, therefore, is not merely an assertion of autonomy; it is a strategic approach for subnational actors to fulfill their unique interests and address issues that may diverge from or align with national priorities. It acknowledges the nuanced realities of globalization, where the impacts of global issues are felt locally, necessitating localized responses. This form of diplomacy enables regional actors to leverage their specific advantages in international collaborations, thereby contributing to global governance without contravening state sovereignty (Aldecoa & Keating, 1999; Duchacek, 1984).

The significance of paradiplomacy has been magnified by the forces of globalization, which have catalyzed the roles of non-state actors in international affairs. This broadening of the diplomatic landscape underscores the complexity and interdependence of global relations today. Through paradiplomacy, subnational entities are empowered to engage in international relations, often with the progress of globalization acting as a backdrop that highlights their increasing importance. The contributions of entities such as NGOs, MNCs, IGOs, religious leaders, and local governments are thus acknowledged as integral components of a multi-track diplomatic strategy that enriches international interactions (Soldatos, 1990; Fathun, 2020).

The theoretical frameworks proposed by scholars such as Panayotis Soldatos and Ivo Duchacek have been instrumental in shaping the understanding of paradiplomacy. These frameworks offer a nuanced perspective on the strategies subnational actors employ to engage with international partners. The categorization into cooperative and parallel models delineates the spectrum of paradiplomacy, ranging from collaborative efforts that are closely coordinated with national diplomacy to more independent initiatives that, while harmonious with broader national interests, assert a degree of autonomy in the international domain (Sulaiman, 2011; Luerdi, 2021).

This diverse spectrum of paradiplomatic activities is further elaborated through the identification of 11 dimensions of study, which encompass international relations, global economics, cultural diplomacy, and beyond. Such a multifaceted approach illustrates the depth and breadth of paradiplomacy, highlighting its capacity to address a wide array of global challenges through localized lenses. The classification into four formulas—Cooperative-coordinate, Cooperative-joint, Parallel-harmony, and Parallel-disharmony—provides a structural understanding of how subnational actors navigate
their international engagements, balancing between collaboration with the state and the pursuit of independent diplomatic objectives (Kuznetsov, 2015).

The evolution of paradiplomacy reflects a broader shift towards a more decentralized and inclusive approach to international relations. This shift recognizes the unique contributions that subnational actors can make towards addressing global challenges, leveraging their localized knowledge and governance capabilities. It also highlights the potential for innovative solutions to emerge from the subnational level, solutions that are grounded in the specific socio-economic, cultural, and environmental contexts of regions and cities.

Moreover, the rise of paradiplomacy signals a recognition of the complex interdependencies that characterize the global system. In a world where local issues can have global implications, and vice versa, the engagement of subnational actors in international diplomacy can facilitate more nuanced and effective responses to global challenges. It underscores the importance of collaboration across all levels of governance, from the local to the global, in crafting sustainable solutions to shared problems.

Paradiplomacy represents a significant evolution in the field of international relations, reflecting the dynamic and interconnected nature of the modern world. By enabling subnational actors to engage directly in international diplomacy, paradiplomacy broadens the scope of international relations, enriches the diplomatic dialogue, and enhances the capacity for global governance. As the world continues to grapple with complex, transboundary challenges, the role of subnational actors in international affairs is likely to become increasingly important, making the study and practice of paradiplomacy more relevant than ever.

3. Result and Discussion

This research findings section delves into the nuanced potential of Jakarta and Galicia in harnessing paradiplomacy for international cooperation, focusing on how both regions utilize their unique strengths—Jakarta’s strategic metropolitan prowess and legal frameworks, and Galicia’s rich cultural heritage and economic vitality. It explores their approaches to fostering sustainable development and global partnerships, highlighting the challenges and opportunities within their respective legal and administrative frameworks. By examining the practical implementations of paradiplomacy, including smart city initiatives and economic enhancement through tourism and industry, this section offers insights into the complementary potential for Jakarta and Galicia to engage in mutually beneficial cooperation. Through a comparative analysis, it underscores the transformative power of paradiplomacy in enabling subnational actors like Jakarta and Galicia to navigate and contribute to the complex tapestry of international relations.

3.1. The potential of paradiplomacy and cooperation carried out by Jakarta

DKI Jakarta Province is the capital of Indonesia located in the south of the Java Sea with a land area of 661.52 km2 and an ocean area of 6,977.5 km2 with approximately 110 islands spread across the Thousand Islands (BPK, 2023). Administratively, Jakarta is divided into 5 municipal areas and 1 administrative district. The municipalities include Central, North, East, South, and West Jakarta, while the Administrative Regency is held...
by the Thousand Islands. The province to the east is bordered by Bekasi Regency/City; to the South with Depok and Bogor regencies/cities, and to the west with Tangerang regencies/cities. In terms of location, Jakarta is considered a strategic area in both domestic and international trade. With the main gate through Tanjung Priok port and Soekarno Hatta Airport. In the first quarter of 2018, Jakarta's economic growth showed a figure of 0.51% compared to the previous quarter, with the highest growth achieved by the export component which grew by 14.11% (Astutik and Gunartin, 2019).

In addition, Jakarta as the capital of Indonesia is a metropolitan city with a population density of more than 10 million people in 2022 (BPJS, 2023). As a metropolitan city as well as the capital of the country, this city is the center of government activities, and offices that are part of the lives of Jakarta residents. Thus, Jakarta must be able to implement every effort to utilize potential that can support sustainable development. One of the efforts that can be done by the capital city of Jakarta is by actively participating through the establishment of cooperation with various other cities abroad.

3.2. Jakarta’s Legal Framework on Foreign Action

The city's participation in international relations is intended so that the city can cooperate with foreign parties in order to exchange ideas, learn, and find various adaptive solutions that are successfully applied by other cities in the world. DKI Jakarta Provincial Government cooperation partners include several cities abroad, international organizations, representatives of foreign countries domiciled in Jakarta. This collaboration plays an important role in achieving the vision of the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government which wants to make the capital of Indonesia an advanced, sustainable, and cultured city with community participation in realizing justice, existence, and welfare.

In the context of foreign cooperation, the legal framework on foreign action is set out in Minister of Foreign Affairs Regulation No. 3 of 2019 concerning General Guidelines for Foreign Relations by Regional Governments which replaces Minister of Foreign Affairs Regulation No. 09/A/KP/XII/2006/01 concerning General Guidelines for Procedures for Foreign Relations and Cooperation. The legal framework of the Minister of Foreign Affairs No. 3 of 2019 discusses the legal basis, foreign relations by local governments, mechanisms for cooperative relations in certain fields by local governments, consular, services to representatives of foreign countries and international organizations in the regions, and protection of foreign nationals in Indonesia.

3.3. The potential of Paradiplomacy and Cooperation Carried out by Galicia

Galicia is one of the autonomous regions of Spain that has been legalized by the Spanish constitution juridically and administratively since 1978. Galicia is one of the autonomous regions of Spain that has a long and good historical value both the Kingdom of Spain and the European community. The territory of Galicia itself is located at the northwestern tip of the Iberian Peninsula and is bordered by the autonomous communities of Asturias and Castile and León to the east, bordered by the Atlantic Ocean to the west, bordered by the Cantabrian Sea to the north, and bordered by Portugal to the south. Galicia has an area of 29,576.74 km². In administrative divisions Galicia has 313 scattered city councils, consisting of 53 comarcas and 4 provinces. With Santiago de Compostela as the capital.
of the Galician region. Galicia also has one of the most iconic places in Spain, Santiago Cathedral.

Galicia has more than 75,000 km of coastal areas. Where there are several small islands next to the coast, islands that are often the highlight of tourism are the island of Arousa, the island of Cíes and Ounces. Xacobeo and Saint James Street are one of the global tourist phenomena of Galicia. At the same time, St. James' Street played a decisive role in the Galician identity associated with Europe and in the phenomenon of EU development. Galicia is also often known as the country of a thousand rivers and has an extraordinary historical, cultural, and natural beauty heritage. Galicia has a distinctive geographical feature, many call the geographical position of Galicia very special because it passes through the route to the main port of the European Union (Rotterdam). Galicia has an access radius of 500 km to the capitals of Spain and Portugal, with continuous connectivity investments such as AVE to Galicia, Intermodal of Ourense, Intermodal Santiago de Compostela, and the airport network, which within a radius of just 2 hours in flight connects Galicia with major markets in the far west of Europe. Galicia has great potential in agriculture and the marine sector (Palau, Pazos-Vidal, Novas, & Espiñeira, 2022).

According to 2020 data, Galicia recorded a population of 2,701,819 inhabitants. The majority of Galician people live in coastal areas of cities such as the cities of Ferrol and Vigo. The city of Vigo is the most populous city in Galicia with a population of 296,692 inhabitants. Galicia has its own regional language it cannot be separated from Galicia which has the same history as Portugal. Because both are derived from the medieval language known as Galician Portuguese. As in all areas of Iusophone, there is a heated debate in the academic and social spheres surrounding its language and orthography in Galicia. Since Spain's entry into democracy and the European Union, Galicia's relations with Portugal have maximized exponentially in all areas thus creating one of the most dynamic Euroregions in the European Union.

Galicia is one of the regions in Spain that has given birth to several well-known companies such as Inditex which is the largest fast fashion company in the world and the parent company of well-known fashion brands such as Zara, Pull&Bear, Bershka, Massimo Dutti, Stradivarius, Oysho, Zara Home, Uterqüe, and Lefties. And Estrella Galicia which is one of the beer products is quite famous in the world. In addition, Galicia also has many international companies engaged in various sectors such as agribusiness food, textiles or automotive and buildings, biotechnology, dairy industry, fisheries, aquaculture, fashion, metalworking and health. Galicia is one of the autonomous regions of Spain that has an excellent export profile (Palau, Pazos-Vidal, Novas, & Espiñeira, 2022).
3.4. Potential Advantages and Disadvantages of Jakarta and Galicia

Table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Jakarta</th>
<th>Galicia</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Formula</td>
<td>Cooperative-Coordinate</td>
<td>Parallel-harmony</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Resource Potential</td>
<td>Jakarta as the city of the center of government and economy in Indonesia</td>
<td>Galicia has great potential in agriculture and marine, agribusiness, textile/automotive, building, biotechnology, dairy, fisheries, aquaculture, fashion, metalworking and health.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participation Level</td>
<td>International</td>
<td>International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advantage</td>
<td>Public facilities in Jakarta are in accordance with smart city indicators</td>
<td>Has many successful companies in the International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack</td>
<td>Lack of maximizing tourism and lack of brand exposure from Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs)</td>
<td>The lack of public features and facilities both in the dissemination of information and others.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the profile between the cities of Jakarta and Galicia, it can be seen that each of these cities has its own potential and shortcomings that can be used as an opportunity for paradiplomacy. As already explained, Jakarta has the advantage of implementing smart city policies, especially in the field of public facilities. This policy is an effort by the Jakarta government to overcome the growing problems of Jakarta's population, both from the increasing birth rate, and urbanization. The denser and fuller the city of Jakarta, the narrower Jakarta's spatial arrangement will be. In order to prevent and control these problems, the concept of smart city in Jakarta must be applied. This can also be said to have succeeded in making it easier for people to use existing facilities.

The existence of the JAKI application (Jakarta Kini) makes official information on OPD and Regional Owned Enterprises (BUMD) of the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government which is intended as a center for the integration of all community services. This application is intended so that the people of Jakarta can access all services in Jakarta through one application only. In an effort to improve Jakarta Smart City, development carried out by the DKI Jakarta Provincial Government is focused on infrastructure, economy, social, and culture. Not only that, to be able to optimize the formation of Jakarta that prioritizes the concept of smart city, a form of cooperation with cities in other countries is needed. One of them is through one of the leading forms of city cooperation or paradiplomacy, namely sister city cooperation.

However, Jakarta also still has some shortcomings that need to be developed in order to be better. One of them is in the field of tourism, the Assistant for Economy and Finance of DKI Jakarta Province said the government has several obstacles in the development of tourism in DKI Jakarta. Attractions of tourist destinations among others
lacking due to inadequate infrastructure and facilities, proper cleanliness and beauty, cooperation with the community, communities and tour operators, lack of publications and information, tourist destinations and their attractiveness rather than optimal coordination between related sectors (Hermansah, 2019). In addition, lack of brand exposure Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises (MSMEs) owned by Jakarta are also one of the shortcomings that need to be developed, especially in the economic sector. The number of MSMEs in Jakarta is not comparable to the economic success of these MSME actors, by building a Brand and brand exposure can create a positive impact, especially on MSME players to pay more attention to the importance of brands to the products they produce. From the existence of branding This is expected to make SMEs more advanced and developed because more attractive products have their own identity so that sales can increase and market segmentation reached also becomes wider and production can increase so that the level of income that affects the welfare of MSME players can also increase (Alvin, 2023).

While the city of Galicia also has advantages and disadvantages that can be developed to conduct paradiplomacy. This city has advantages in the field of tourism, it can be seen from Galicia which has many tourist attractions, such as Galicia has one of the most iconic places in Spain, namely Santiago Cathedral. Galicia has more than 75,000 km of coastal areas. Where there are several small islands next to the coast, islands that are often the highlight of tourism are the island of Arousa, the island of Cies and Ounces. Xacobeo and Saint James Street are one of the global tourist phenomena of Galicia. At the same time, St. James’ Street played a decisive role in the Galician identity associated with Europe and in the phenomenon of EU development. Galicia is also often known as the country of a thousand rivers and has an extraordinary historical, cultural, and natural beauty heritage. Galicia has a distinctive geographical feature, many call the geographical position of Galicia very special because it passes through the route to the main port of the European Union (Rotterdam). In addition, Galicia also has many international companies engaged in various sectors such as agribusiness food, textiles or automotive and buildings, biotechnology, dairy industry, fisheries, aquaculture, fashion, and health. Galicia is one of the autonomous regions of Spain which has an excellent export profile (Palau, Pazos-Vidal, Novas, & Espiñeira, 2022). One of the companies from Galicia that can go global is ZARA products from the parent company Inditex, which is engaged in fashion. However, Galicia itself is a city that is still minimal in public features and facilities both in disseminating information and others.

In paradiplomacy, these two cities have different formulas for each implementation. Jakarta itself uses the Cooperative-Coordinate formula, where this model explains that the involvement of local governments in international relations is still under supervision from the central government and regional involvement is the result of formal inclusion of various actors within the country. Meanwhile, Galicia uses the Parallel-harmony formula, which explains that local governments can act independently in international relations affairs according to their capabilities. But every action they take in international relations affairs must not conflict with the foreign affairs of the central or national government (Meutia et al., 2019). Jakarta and Galicia have reached the level of international participation because both cities have collaborated with other cities outside the regional area.
3.5. Paradiplomacy that Jakarta can do with Galicia

The concept of paradiplomacy involves subnational units like cities and regions in international relations, enabling them to undertake diplomatic activities independently of national governments. This form of diplomacy is increasingly recognized for its capacity to foster international cooperation and development at the subnational level (Duchacek, 1984). Jakarta and Galicia, with their unique geographical, economic, and cultural contexts, exemplify the potential for paradiplomatic engagement to leverage their respective strengths and address common challenges. Their collaborative potential is particularly notable in the realms of smart city development and economic improvement through tourism and MSMEs (Aldecoa & Keating, 1999).

Jakarta, as Indonesia's capital, has been at the forefront of adopting smart city initiatives aimed at enhancing urban governance, sustainability, and livability through the integration of information technology (Devega, 2017). This commitment to smart city principles reflects Jakarta's efforts to improve infrastructure, public services, and citizen engagement, marking significant strides towards becoming a more connected and responsive metropolis. Conversely, Galicia's endeavors in smart city policies, though in the nascent stages, offer a rich tapestry of cultural and historical assets that can be integrated into smart tourism and heritage preservation initiatives (Devega, 2017).

The synergy between Jakarta and Galicia in smart city development presents an avenue for mutual learning and exchange. Jakarta's experience in deploying technology for urban management can provide valuable insights for Galicia, potentially accelerating its smart city ambitions. Conversely, Galicia's approach to incorporating cultural heritage within its smart city framework could offer Jakarta innovative perspectives on enhancing urban aesthetics and cultural tourism, an area where Jakarta seeks to expand its capabilities.

Furthermore, the economic dimension of their paradiplomacy emphasizes the potential for collaboration in tourism and support for MSMEs. Galicia's robust tourism industry, anchored by iconic destinations like Santiago Cathedral and the Camino de Santiago, coupled with its vibrant MSME sector, serves as a model for Jakarta. By engaging in paradiplomatic exchanges, Jakarta can draw on Galicia's expertise to bolster its tourism sector and enhance the global competitiveness of its MSMEs, fostering economic growth and diversification (Aldecoa & Keating, 1999).

6. Conclusion

The potential for paradiplomatic collaboration between Jakarta and Galicia, as explored in this research, highlights a compelling pathway towards sustainable urban development and economic growth. Jakarta's emerging success in implementing its Smart City initiative, characterized by its integration of innovative transportation solutions like the MRT and LRT and the JAKI app for disseminating city information, sets a foundational model for smart urban management. This initiative, aimed at improving quality of life and ensuring efficient city management, positions Jakarta as a pivotal gateway to Indonesia's economic advancement, further bolstered by strategic assets such as the Tanjung Priok port and Soekarno Hatta International Airport.
Conversely, Galicia's rich tapestry of cultural heritage and its robust tourism sector, underscored by the iconic Santiago Cathedral and the Camino de Santiago, along with its significant contributions to the global fashion industry through brands like ZARA, Pull & Bear, and Bershka, showcase its economic dynamism and cultural vibrancy. The strategic geographical location of Galicia, serving as a conduit to major European hubs, complements its economic and cultural propositions, enhancing its appeal as a partner in international cooperation.

The exploration of these unique strengths and opportunities underscores the potential benefits of a Sister City partnership between Jakarta and Galicia. Such a collaboration could foster mutual learning and exchange, leveraging Jakarta's advancements in smart city development and Galicia's prowess in tourism and global fashion branding. This partnership holds the promise of addressing Jakarta's infrastructural needs and enhancing MSME visibility, while also benefiting Galicia through the exchange of smart city technologies and strategies for urban development.

Moreover, the intersection of Jakarta's and Galicia's efforts in the international relations sphere indicates a readiness for such cooperation, with both cities actively engaging with global partners. The anticipated Sister City relationship between Jakarta and Galicia could serve as a beacon for how cities can collaborate across borders to tackle common challenges, share best practices, and jointly advance towards sustainable and inclusive urban development.

In conclusion, this research posits that the potential Sister City cooperation between Jakarta and Galicia is not merely an opportunity for bilateral growth but also a testament to the power of paradiplomacy in bridging diverse urban ecosystems for global good. By harnessing their respective strengths and addressing shared challenges, Jakarta and Galicia can pave the way for innovative solutions to urban development, economic growth, and cultural exchange, setting a precedent for future paradiplomatic endeavors worldwide.

References


Awaliyah, Laila (2023) Pattern Of Sister City Cooperation In Indonesia, Case Study: Sister City Of Dki Jakarta Provincial Government For The Period 2018 – 2022


